

Boost Free Lessons - Year 10 English

Lesson 4: Selecting Evidence

Name: _____ Grade: _____ Date: _____

Worked Example 1

Which piece of evidence better supports the claim, and why?

Claim: the library closure has affected student learning.

A. Many students have told me they miss the library.

B. Since the closure, the number of students sent out of afternoon classes has risen from four a week to nineteen.

1. Evidence must be **relevant**, **specific** and **verifiable**.
2. A is relevant but vague. *Many* is unmeasured, and it reports feelings rather than effects.
3. B is specific, measurable, and directly about learning rather than preference.
4. B is also checkable against school records, which A is not.

B. It is specific, measurable, checkable, and it addresses learning rather than how students feel.

Worked Example 2

Why is the evidence below a poor choice, even though it is true?

Claim: the canteen should offer more vegetarian meals.

Evidence: vegetarian diets can reduce the risk of heart disease in adults.

1. Ask whether the evidence supports **this** claim, not a related one.
2. The claim is about canteen demand. The evidence is about long-term adult health.
3. It is true and it sounds relevant, which is what makes the error easy to miss.
4. Better evidence would measure demand: how many students currently want vegetarian meals.

It is true but not relevant. The claim is about demand in a school canteen; the evidence is about adult health outcomes.

Remember: Evidence must be **relevant**, **specific** and **verifiable**. True is not the same as relevant. Ask whether the evidence supports **this** claim or merely a related one.



Question 1: Write whether each piece of evidence is **strong** or **weak**.

1. Claim: the bus route needs more services. Evidence: passengers were left behind at three stops on Tuesday.

2. Claim: the bus route needs more services. Evidence: public transport is important.

3. Claim: uniforms reduce cost. Evidence: a survey found families spent \$180 less per year.

4. Claim: uniforms reduce cost. Evidence: uniforms look smart.

5. Claim: the pool should reopen. Evidence: 340 residents signed a petition.

6. Claim: the pool should reopen. Evidence: swimming is a life skill.

7. Claim: homework should be reduced. Evidence: students in Year 9 report 2.5 hours a night.

8. Claim: homework should be reduced. Evidence: I do not enjoy homework.



Question 2: Read the passage below, then answer the questions.

Borrowing has fallen 38 per cent since the library hours changed. Reading is important. Libraries have existed for thousands of years. Several students have mentioned that the new hours are inconvenient.

1. Which piece of evidence in the passage is strongest? Explain.

2. Which is weakest? Explain.

3. Identify one piece of evidence that is true but not relevant.

4. What evidence is missing from this argument?

5. Rewrite the weakest evidence to make it stronger.



Question 3: Answer the following questions.

1. Write a claim about your school.

2. Write strong evidence for it, and explain what makes it strong.

3. Explain the difference between evidence that is true and evidence that is relevant.

4. Why is one strong piece of evidence usually better than three weak ones?





Every student has gaps. The hard part is knowing exactly where they are.
That is what a Boost assessment is for.

Book a Free Assessment

Normally valued at \$199, free for new families

- A friendly skills check aligned to the NSW syllabus
- Face to face with our qualified tutors
- A clear picture of your child's strengths and gaps
- A weekly plan built around what they actually need

Book a Free Assessment →

boosttutoring.com.au/contact



Answers and Model Responses: Selecting Evidence**Question 1**

1. Strong
2. Weak
3. Strong
4. Weak
5. Strong
6. Weak
7. Strong
8. Weak

Question 2

1. Model: the 38 per cent drop in borrowing, because it is specific, measured and directly related to library use.
2. Model: *reading is important*, because it is a general statement that would support almost any claim.
3. Model: *libraries have existed for thousands of years*. It is true, but it says nothing about this library.
4. Model: evidence about what students did instead, and whether the drop in borrowing affected results.
5. Model: A survey of 200 students found that 64 per cent had not borrowed a book since the change in hours.

Question 3

1. Model response: The school should install more bike racks.
2. Model response: A count taken over five mornings found an average of 34 bikes for 12 spaces, with the surplus chained to fences. This is strong because it is measured, repeated across several days, and directly about the shortage the claim describes.
3. True evidence is accurate. Relevant evidence supports the specific claim being made. A statement can be entirely true and still prove nothing about the point at hand.
4. A weak piece invites the reader to challenge it, and one successful challenge casts doubt on everything around it. A single strong piece gives them nothing easy to attack.

